

In the Shadows of Grant and Sherman:

George B. McClellan Revisited
Thomas J. Rowland (bio)

Thomas J. Rowland

Thomas J. Rowland holds a master's degree in theology from the Washington Theological Union and a doctorate in history from George Washington University. He is currently completing research for a book that reconsiders the place of early Federal military command in Civil War history.

Footnotes

1. The McClellan memorial is situated two miles north of the Mall and is framed by the convergence of Connecticut Avenue, Columbia Road, and California Street. By comparison, Grant's memorial rests immediately west of the Capitol, while Sherman's is just behind the Treasury Building, flanked by the White House. For details on the McClellan statuary, see Mildred Baruch and Ellen Eckman, *Civil War Monuments* (Washington, D.C.: Daughters of Union Veterans of the Civil War, 1978), 24.
2. For an excellent review of the early McClellan historiography, see Joseph Harsh, "On the McClellan-Go-Round," *Civil War History* 19 (June 1973): 101-8. T. Harry Williams, *McClellan, Sherman and Grant* (New Brunswick, N.J.: Rutgers Univ. Press, 1962), 11; Bruce Catton, *Reflections on the Civil War* (New York: Doubleday, 1981), 82; Kenneth P. Williams, *Lincoln Finds a General*, 5 vols. (New York: MacMillan, 1949-59), 2:479.
3. T. Harry Williams, *Lincoln and His Generals* (New York: Knopf, 1952), 25; A. L. Long, ed., *Memoirs of Robert E. Lee* (Secaucus, N.J.: Blue and Grey Press, 1983), 267; Warren W. Hassler, Jr., *Commanders of the Army of the Potomac* (Baton Rouge: Louisiana State Univ. Press, 1962), 64; James G. Randall, *Lincoln the President*, 5 vols. (New York: Simon and Schuster, 1945-53), 2:65-86, 108-25.
4. Harsh, "McClellan-Go-Round," 101-19; Williams, *Lincoln Finds a General* 2:479; Allan Nevins, *The War for the Union*, 4 vols. (New York: Scribner's, 1959-71), 2:231-32; Maj.-Gen. James Fry, "McClellan and His Mission," *Century Magazine* (New York, 1894), 48:931-45; Russell F. Weigley, *Towards an American Army: Military Thought from Washington to Marshall* (New York: Columbia Univ. Press, 1962), 81-93; Williams, *McClellan, Sherman and Grant*, 45-77; David Donald, ed., *Why the North Won the Civil War* (Baton Rouge: Louisiana State Univ. Press, 1960), 52-53.
5. Unlike Grant and Sherman, McClellan lost the only draft of his memoirs to fire and was in the process of reconstructing them at the time of his death. However, his literary executor, Edward C. Prime, did publish selected letters of his Civil War career in *McClellan's Own Story* (New York: Webster's, 1887). His official papers are housed in the Manuscript Division of the Library of Congress. For an excellent guide to the McClellan Papers, see Stephen W. Sears, *The Civil War Papers of George B. McClellan* (New York: Da Capo Press, 1992).
6. Stephen W. Sears, *George B. McClellan: The Young Napoleon* (New York: Ticknor and Fields, 1985), xii. For reviewer's quote, see Harold Holzer (*Chicago Tribune*) found on jacket cover of *ibid.* For studies suggesting a needed balance and new perspective of McClellan's career, see Harsh, "McClellan-Go-Round," and Edward C. Hagerman, "The Professionalization of George B. McClellan and Early Civil War Command: An Institutional Perspective," *Civil War History* 21 (Dec. 1975): 113-35.
7. Irving Stone, *They Also Ran: The Story of Those Men Who Were Defeated for the Presidency* (New York: Doubleday, 1943), 160.
8. Williams, *Lincoln Finds a General* 2:479; Nevins, *War for the Union* 2:331-32; Williams, *Lincoln and His Generals*, 26-27; *idem*, *McClellan, Sherman and Grant*, 40-42; Sears, *George B. McClellan*, 1-29. Most recently, another historian has leveled the charge that McClellan suffered from a "paranoid personality disorder" which ultimately prevented him from "performing his duties as commanding general and general in chief satisfactorily." See Joseph T. Glatthaar, *Partners in Command* (New York: The Free Press, 1994), 237-42.
9. For McPherson quote, see cover jacket of Stephen W. Sears, *The Civil War Papers of George B. McClellan*. David Hackett Fisher, *Historians' Fallacies* (New York: Harper Torchbook, 1970), 213.

10. For a clinical discussion of the myriad disorders ascribed to McClellan's mental health status, see Steven A. Schroeder, Marcus A. Krupp, Lawrence M. Tierney, Jr., and Stephen J. McPhee, eds., *Current Medical Diagnosis and Treatment* (East Norwalk, Conn: Langer, 1990), 693-710; and American Psychiatric Association, *Diagnostic and Statistical Manual of Mental Disorders* (Washington, D.C.: A.P.A., 1987), 199-204, 213-34, 335-58.
11. Sears, *George B. McClellan*, 63; Richard E. Beringer, Herman Hattaway, Archer Jones, and William N. Still, Jr., *Why the South Lost the Civil War* (Athens: Univ. of Georgia Press, 1986), 3. For veteran's quote, see Gerald F. Linderman, *Embattled Courage* (New York: Free Press, 1987), 106; Charles Royster, *The Destructive War: William Tecumseh Sherman, Stonewall Jackson, and the Americans* (New York: Knopf, 1991), 63, 77, 267-69.
12. For an overview of McClellan's varied career, see William Starr Myers, *A Study in Personality: George B. McClellan* (New York: Appleton-Century, 1934), and Sears, *George B. McClellan*, 4-70.
13. Sears, *George B. McClellan*, 1-67, 371-406.
14. John F. Marszalek, *Sherman: A Soldier's Passion for Order* (New York: Free Press, 1993), 160-65; "W. T. Sherman to General Lorenzo Thomas, November 16, 1861," in William T. Sherman, *Memoirs of General William T. Sherman*, 2 vols. (New York: D. Appleton, 1891), 1:240-41; Albert T. Castel, *Decision in the West: The Atlanta Campaign of 1864* (Lawrence: Univ. of Kansas Press, 1992), 41-42.
15. Charles E. Vetter, *Sherman: Merchant of Terror, Advocate of Peace* (Gretna, La.: Pelican Press, 1992), 96; Marszalek, *A Soldier's Passion*, 169.
16. William S. McFeely, *Grant* (New York: Norton, 1981), 29-66.
17. *Ibid.*, 52-55, 74-76.
18. Randall argued that too much has been read into McClellan's correspondence with his wife and felt that his letters were a "kind of studied release, not to be taken seriously" (*Lincoln the President* 2:73).
19. Charles B. Strozier, *Lincoln's Quest for Union* (New York: Basic Books, 1982), 44-45, 204-9; McFeely's quote is found in the introduction to the *Memoirs of General William T. Sherman* (New York: Da Capo Press Edition, 1984), x.
20. Sears, *George B. McClellan*, xii; "George B. McClellan to Abraham Lincoln, July 7, 1862," and "George B. McClellan to Henry Wager Halleck, August 1, 1862," in U.S. War Department, *The War of the Rebellion: A Compilation of the Official Records of the Union and Confederate Armies*, 128 vols. (Washington, D.C.: GPO, 1880-1901), ser. 1, vol. 11:73-74, 345-46 (hereafter cited as *OR*). For McClellan's political and social views, see McClellan, *McClellan's Own Story*, 29-36.
21. Mark E. Neely, Jr., *The Fate of Liberty: Abraham Lincoln and Civil Liberties* (New York: Oxford Univ. Press, 1991), 35-36; John G. Nicolay and John Hay, *Abraham Lincoln: A History*, 10 vols. (New York: Century, 1886-1990), 5:125-26; James M. McPherson, *Battle Cry of Freedom* (New York: Oxford Univ. Press, 1988), 499; John J. Hennessy, *Return to Bull Run: The Campaign and Battle of Second Manassas* (New York: Simon and Schuster, 1993), 13-20; George B. McClellan, *Report on the Organization of the Army of the Potomac, and Its Campaigns in Virginia and Maryland* (Washington, D.C.: GPO, 1864), 16-17.
22. Marszalek, *A Soldier's Passion*, 257, 347-55; Ulysses S. Grant, *Memoirs of U. S. Grant*, 2 vols. (New York: Century, 1885-86), 2:116.
23. Brian Holden Reid, "Historians and the Joint Committee on the Conduct of the War," *Civil War History* 38 (Dec. 1992): 338-41.
24. Michael Howard, "Jomini and the Classical Tradition in Military Thought," in *Studies in War and Peace* (New York: Norton, 1971), 31; T. Harry Williams, "The Military Leadership of the North and South," in David Donald, ed., *Why the North Won the Civil War* (Baton Rouge: Louisiana State Univ. Press, 1960), 28-30; John R. Elting, "Jomini: Disciple of Napoleon?" *Military Affairs* 27 (Spring 1964): 26; Hagerman, "An Institutional Perspective," 113.

25. "George B. McClellan to Simon Cameron, October 31, 1861," and "George B. McClellan to Edwin M. Stanton, January 31, 1862," in Sears, *The Civil War Papers of George B. McClellan*, 114-19, 162-70.
26. Edwin C. Fishel, "Pinkerton and McClellan: Who Deceived Whom?" *Civil War History* 34 (June 1988): 115-42; Harsh, "McClellan-Go-Round," 115.
27. For the most recent narration of the Peninsula campaign, see Stephen W. Sears, *To the Gates of Richmond: The Peninsula Campaign* (New York: Ticknor and Fields, 1992). A very favorable assessment of McClellan's peninsular campaign is found in Rowena Reed, *Combined Operations in the Civil War* (Annapolis: Naval Institute Press, 1978).
28. Hassler, *Commanders of the Army of the Potomac*, 38-51. Concerning the defenses of Washington, McClellan's supporters have always referred to his calculations (including Banker's division but not McDowell's corps) of 55,456 defenders. See, "George B. McClellan to Lorenzo Thomas, April 1, 1862," in *OR*, vol. 5, 1:60-61. McClellan's detractors have generally discounted forces assigned to the valley and place the number of defenders at around 27,000. See, Sears, *To the Gates of Richmond*, 34.
29. Marszalek, *A Soldier's Passion*, 176-77, 182; Castel, *Decision in the West*, 39-42; William L. Barney, *Flawed Victory: A New Perspective on the Civil War* (Lanham, Md.: Univ. Press of America, 1980), 7-8.
30. McPherson, *Battle Cry of Freedom*, 397-412, 676-77; Herman Hattaway and Archer Jones, *How the North Won* (Urbana: Univ. of Illinois Press, 1983), 410-11; Michael C. C. Adams, *Our Masters the Rebels* (Cambridge: Harvard Univ. Press, 1978), 91; "U. S. Grant to Julia D. Dent, June 26, 1861," in John Y. Simon, ed., *The Papers of Ulysses S. Grant*, 9 vols. (Carbondale: Univ. of Southern Illinois, 1967-), 2:49-51.
31. Stephen W. Sears, *Landscape Turned Red: The Battle of Antietam* (New York: Ticknor and Fields, 1983), 310; Barney, *Flawed Victory*, 9.
32. Hattaway and Jones, *How the North Won*, 694.
33. "Ulysses S. Grant to George Gordon Meade, April 9, 1864," in Grant, *Memoirs* 2:135; Castel, *Decision in the West*, 565.
34. Linderman, *Embattled Courage*, 265; McClellan, *McClellan's Report*, 22-23; *OR*, vol. 12, 1:473-74. It should be noted that even Grant in 1864 was prone to hyperbole, remarking to Halleck that the "Army of the Potomac is in splendid condition and evidently feels like whipping somebody." Quoted in John S. Bowman, ed., *The Civil War Almanac* (New York: World Almanac Publications, 1983), 195.